

1

STATE OF CONNECTICUT  
COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND OPPORTUNITIES

1

2

3

4

5

6

SPECIAL COMMISSION MEETING  
LEGISLATIVE OFFICE BUILDING  
300 CAPITOL AVENUE, ROOM 1C  
HARTFORD, CT 06106

7

8

9

THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 30, 2006  
3:00 P.M.

10

11 COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

12

Andrew M. Norton, Chairman  
Edward Mambruno, Secretary  
Gloria Mengual  
Jimmie L. Griffin  
Cheryl Lynn Clarke  
Larry D. Conaway  
Lillian H. Brown  
John Lobon

13

14

15

16

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:

17

George A. Marshall

18

STAFF PRESENT

19

20

R. Hamisi Ingram  
Robert Brothers  
Raymond P. Pech

21

22

23

24

2

1

. . . . Verbatim transcript of the

2

Special Commission meeting of the Commissioners on

3

Human Rights and Opportunities, Thursday, November 30,

4 2006, at 3:00 p.m. at the Legislative Office Building,  
5 Room 1C, 300 Capitol Avenue, Hartford, CT, at which  
6 time the Commissioners, CHRO staff and public were  
7 represented as hereinbefore set forth . . . .

8

9 CHAIRMAN NORTON: I would like to call  
10 this meeting to order.

11 My name is Andrew Norton, and I am the  
12 Chairman of the Commission on Human Rights and  
13 Opportunities in Connecticut, and I am going to read  
14 this notice that was delivered more than 24 hours ago  
15 to the Secretary of the State. And it reads:

16 "Dear Madam/Sir,

17 This letter serves as notice that the  
18 Commissioners of the Commission on Human Rights and  
19 Opportunities have scheduled a Special Commission  
20 meeting to be held on Thursday, November 30, 2006 at  
21 3:00 p.m. For members of the public wishing to  
22 attend, the meeting will be held at the Legislative  
23 Office Building, Room 1C, 300 Capitol Avenue, Hartford  
24 Connecticut.

3

1 The agenda for the meeting is as  
2 follows:

3 (A)(1) Pending litigation

4 (2) Such other claims as may arise

5 (B) Personnel Matters, including

6 (1) Annual evaluation of the

7 Executive Director,

8 (2) Performance of the Executive  
9 Director,

10 (3) Consideration or Action as to  
11 whether R. Hamisi Ingram should be disciplined or  
12 dismissed as the Executive Director of the CHRO

13 (4) Such other personnel matters as  
14 they may arise

15 The Commission reserves the right to  
16 conduct an executive session during the meeting for  
17 any purpose authorized by statute.

18 Sincerely,

19 Ray Pech, Assistant Director

20 The Commissioners are cc'ed, as is R.  
21 Hamisi Ingram, Executive Director.

22 So, with that I'll call the meeting to  
23 order at 3:05 on November 30, 2006. We're in room 1C  
24 of the Legislative Office Building.

4

1 And this isn't something we normally  
2 do, but I thought I would ask Secretary Mambruno to  
3 call the roll.

4 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: Okay.  
5 Mr. Chair, Special Commission Meeting, Meeting Date  
6 Thursday, November 30th at 3:10 p.m.

7 Gloria Mengual, please say here.

8 MS. MENGUAL: Here.

9 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: George  
10 Marshall. George Marshall.

11 John Lobon.

12 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Here.

13 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: Jimmie Griffin.

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Here.

15 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: Larry Conaway.

16 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: Here.

17 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: Cheryl Lynn

18 Clarke.

19 COMMISSIONER CLARKE: Here.

20 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: Lillian H.

21 Brown.

22 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Present.

23 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: Andrew M.

24 Norton, Chair.

5

1 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Here.

2 COMMISSIONER MAMBRUNO: And Edward

3 Mambruno, here.

4 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Thank you very much.

5 And is there any member who hasn't had

6 a chance to sign that sheet. (No response.)

7 George Marshall called me this morning

8 to say that his son, a different son, was -- who works

9 in Mental Health in Trumbull was playing basketball

10 with some of the clientele and just ripped up his knee

11 in some fashion playing basketball yesterday, and

12 George will be missing this meeting. In fact, he'll

13 be taking off work to help his son get to the hospital

14 or doctor this afternoon. So, we don't expect him.

15                   So, we have eight out of nine  
16 Commissioners here. Obviously a quorum. And we don't  
17 expect the ninth, unfortunately.

18                   So, the first order of -- there are no  
19 minutes for us to approve, this being a special  
20 meeting. We will approve the last meeting's minutes  
21 at the next regular meeting.

22                   The agenda for the meeting starts with  
23 (A)(1) Pending Litigation, and I will turn to David  
24 Teed to see whether there is any pending litigation,

6  
1 and whether we need to go to executive session to  
2 discuss it.

3                   ATTORNEY TEED: Actually, there's only  
4 one item to report, and I can do it publicly, because  
5 the decision is public. The first thing this morning  
6 I received notice from the United States Court of  
7 Appeals for the Second Circuit. They ruled in favor  
8 of the CHRO in the matter of Femi Bogle-Assegai versus  
9 CHRO. So, that decision is now out. That case,  
10 unless she appeals to the U.S. Supreme Court, will be  
11 closed.

12                   That's all I have.

13                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: Excellent. And good  
14 work on the lawyers part. Thank you.

15                   Are there any other claims? I take it  
16 not.

17                   ATTORNEY TEED: No.

18                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: (B) Personnel  
19 Matters, including annual evaluation of the Executive  
20 Director.

21                   In a letter to the Executive Director I  
22 told him that he could, as always, ask that what might  
23 normally be an executive session discussion be done in  
24 public. I said to him that he would be invited to

7  
1 address the Commission, whether we held it in public  
2 or in executive session.

3                   Mr. Ingram said to me that he would  
4 like to have it in public session.

5                   Just in case you have any different  
6 view, we can be in executive session. If you'd like  
7 to change your mind, or we can be in public session,  
8 and either way you'd be invited to address us.

9                   Do you hold to the -- you'd like to be  
10 in public session?

11                  MR. INGRAM: I do.

12                  CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. Then at this  
13 point in time I would like to give the floor, as it  
14 were, to Mr. Ingram.

15                  As the Commissioners are aware, on  
16 November 9th we passed an evaluation of the Executive  
17 Director, covering the year from August 15, 2005 to  
18 August 15, 2006.

19                  On November 20th the Executive Director  
20 did respond to that annual evaluation, and sent copies  
21 to me and the Commissioners. And the --

22                           COMMISSIONER BROWN: Point of  
23 information, Mr. Chairman.

24                           CHAIRMAN NORTON: Sure.

8

1                           COMMISSIONER BROWN: I did not receive  
2 whatever these brown books everybody is carrying  
3 around. And if they were sent through mail, it never  
4 reached my place of residence.

5                           CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. Mr. Teed has a  
6 copy that he can lend you, give you, for the purposes  
7 of this meeting.

8                           And, as you may recall, we did four  
9 things, as it were, or something in four parts at the  
10 November 9th meeting. We adopted two versions of an  
11 annual evaluation, both the PARS form and the other  
12 form, whose name I forget, because both those versions  
13 had been employed in the previous annual evaluation.

14                           We also adopted a somewhat lengthy, and  
15 I think 27 point addendum, outlining other problems  
16 that we had seen over the course of the year, and a  
17 description of them which couldn't have possibly fit  
18 in those forms.

19                           And we also had a cover letter.  
20 Mr. Ingram had earlier written to say that he would  
21 like to address the Commission in public session, and  
22 he is now being allowed to do so.

23                           In that letter he also said that these  
24 various resolutions had been passed restricting in

9

1 some way his powers. We pointed out in that letter  
2 that though those resolutions had been passed, they  
3 weren't linked up to the evaluation. They happened at  
4 the same time, but not for exactly the same reason.  
5 They weren't the same project.

6                   And one other point I would like to  
7 make is that Mr. Ingram sent me -- but I think all of  
8 us -- a letter yesterday saying that he would like to  
9 delay the part of this meeting which dealt with  
10 performance and/or potential discipline or dismissal.

11                   It is -- the advice I have been given  
12 -- well, there's two things I'm going to read.

13                   "It is also been -- it has been  
14 suggested that there are certain protections afforded  
15 to the Office of Executive Director by a 1985 US.  
16 Supreme Court decision called Cleveland Board of  
17 Education versus Loudermill," a 21 year old case.

18                   It is my clear understanding, this is  
19 me talking -- it is my clear understanding from more  
20 than one expert source that the Loudermill decision  
21 and the protections provided therein do not apply to  
22 this job, the job of Executive Director.

23                   But I would like to turn to David Teed,  
24 our Assistant Attorney General, to elaborate.

10

1                   ATTORNEY TEED: The Loudermill case  
2 does not apply in this situation because the Executive  
3 Director serves at the pleasure of the Commission and

4 has no property right in his position.

5                   And in fact, this -- you may recall,  
6 this was stated in the Chair's letter to the Executive  
7 Director three weeks ago on November 9th, '06.

8                   And I'd also point out, in 1998 when  
9 the legislature passed Public Act 98-245 to provide  
10 that the Executive Director serves at the pleasure of  
11 the Commission, this is what the sponsor of the bill,  
12 Representative Michael Lawlor, said on the floor of  
13 the house.

14                   "Also, Mr. Speaker, this amendment  
15 clarifies that the Commission has the right to  
16 discharge the Executive Director at any time effective  
17 July 1, 1998, even during the four year term to which  
18 the Executive Director has been appointed. Therefore  
19 it's clear that the Executive Director has no property  
20 interest in this position and that the Loudermill case  
21 does not apply."

22                   That being said, it may be noted that  
23 even though the Commission had no obligation to do so,  
24 the Commission did give the Executive Director notice

11

1 and an opportunity to be heard.

2                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: And previously we  
3 invited the Executive Director over to spend 10/11  
4 days to provide us a written response, which, of  
5 course, would also be an activity mentally preparing  
6 one to defend any shortcomings pointed out in the

7 annual evaluation. And he did in writing, and that  
8 was received last week. And now, here we are with an  
9 additional opportunity to speak to us orally.

10 And again, both of those opportunities  
11 we provided for him. You can argue about whether  
12 they're good ideas or bad ideas, but they are not  
13 required in law for the type of position that he  
14 holds.

15 But having said that, we do now invite  
16 you, Mr. Ingram, to address us, frankly, in any way  
17 that you see fit to. And address us on any points  
18 that you'd like to.

19 MR. INGRAM: Well, Mr. Chair, I would  
20 at this point ask that the Commission reconsider  
21 postponing items other than the annual evaluation.

22 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. Do you have  
23 anything -- well, do you have anything else on the  
24 evaluation?

12

1 Item -- let me just get back to my --  
2 get back to my agenda.

3 Item (A)(B)(1) the annual evaluation of  
4 the Executive Director. Let me put off that at this  
5 point. You're asking us to postpone Items -- once  
6 again, which items are you asking us to postpone?

7 MR. INGRAM: Items other than  
8 (A)(B)(1).

9 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Items other than --

10 MR. INGRAM: (B)(1). Items (B)(2) and

11 (3) be postponed until a later date.

12 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. If we could  
13 just --

14 MR. INGRAM: In order for me to avail  
15 myself of counsel.

16 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. And let me ask  
17 you though -- I'm going to just stick to the schedule  
18 right now. I'm not avoiding that question, I'm just  
19 going to stay on schedule. Do you have any comments  
20 or discussion you would like to make about Item  
21 (B)(1)?

22 MR. INGRAM: I do.

23 CHAIRMAN NORTON: An item you are not  
24 asking to be postponed?

13

1 MR. INGRAM: I do.

2 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Why don't we do that  
3 now. And you can re-ask the question you just asked  
4 all over again.

5 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: Mr. Chairman.

6 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Sure.

7 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: Let me just get  
8 some clarification. Mr. Ingram is asking for us to --  
9 we're going to do Items (B), and what numbers are  
10 those?

11 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Yeah. Advise -- I  
12 hope I don't -- tell me if I've misstated this. We  
13 have laid out on our agenda a discussion of the annual

14 evaluation of the Executive Director.

15 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: (1) through (4).

16 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Yes.

17 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: And what is  
18 Mr. Ingram -- could you clarify, what is it that we're  
19 asking here?

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: He just wants to  
21 do (1). He doesn't want to do anything else, but (1).

22 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: Oh, just (1).

23 MR. INGRAM: I don't have the agenda  
24 that you have. I only have the letter. And I assume

14

1 that --

2 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. Let me give  
3 you an agenda.

4 MR. INGRAM: I assume --

5 CHAIRMAN NORTON: It doesn't --

6 MR. INGRAM: I assume --

7 CHAIRMAN NORTON: It doesn't vary much  
8 in substance.

9 MR. INGRAM: I assume it's the same  
10 thing as in my letter. But there is an Item (B)  
11 Personnel Matters.

12 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: And there's four  
13 points of Item (B)?

14 MR. INGRAM: Correct. Correct. And  
15 I'm asking that points (2) and (3) be postponed until  
16 a later date in order for me to avail myself of  
17 representation.

18 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: Thank you.

19 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. But if --  
20 having heard that, if you follow me, what I would like  
21 to do is go to Item (B)(1) Annual Evaluation, and then  
22 let him re-ask that -- make that request again when we  
23 get to Item (B)(2), because he's not asking for us to  
24 postpone Item (B)(1).

15

1 COMMISSIONER CONAWAY: Okay.

2 CHAIRMAN NORTON: If I'm getting it  
3 right. So, we aren't there yet.

4 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: You're going  
5 step by step is what you're saying.

6 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Exactly.

7 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Okay. Let's do  
8 that.

9 CHAIRMAN NORTON: So, that's what I  
10 would like to do at this point.

11 So, if you would like to address the  
12 annual evaluation that we had done -- what we worked  
13 on through the summer and fall, and adopted on  
14 November 9th and turned in to you, please proceed.

15 MR. INGRAM: I have a series of  
16 questions to ask of the Commissioners who participated  
17 in the evaluation process. It's my understanding from  
18 you that they all did, and I wish to address each  
19 Commissioner individually.

20 CHAIRMAN NORTON: I'm not going to do

21 that. That -- that -- no. This isn't a hearing. But  
22 if it was a hearing, it wouldn't be of the strange  
23 sort that the people conducting the hearing were going  
24 to be the ones getting asked questions.

16

1 If you want to pose some broader issues  
2 and pose some subject matter for reflection by the  
3 Commissioners . . . but I'm not going to -- I'm  
4 subject to be overruled by the large majority of you,  
5 but I'm not going to turn this around into an inquiry  
6 of the Commissioners.

7 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Thank you,  
8 Mr. Chair. I think that's all you have to say.

9 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: That's all you  
10 have to say.

11 CHAIRMAN NORTON: But please, any  
12 statements you have or any disputes you want to raise  
13 with the findings we adopted three weeks ago.

14 MR. INGRAM: I've submitted in writing  
15 a document to all of you for your consideration.

16 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Except me.

17 MR. INGRAM: I submitted it to you  
18 also, ma'am.

19 COMMISSIONER BROWN: I did not receive  
20 it.

21 MR. INGRAM: I understand you didn't  
22 get it, but it was submitted. I don't know why you  
23 didn't get it.

24 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Neither do I.

17

1                   MR. INGRAM:  But I submitted it to all  
2   of you, and Attorney Teed.  The same document.  And my  
3   responses in those documents stand for my presentation  
4   tonight.  Inasmuch as you do not wish me to query what  
5   went on and what was involved in this evaluation  
6   process, I'm left without anything to do, but stand  
7   upon that document.

8                   CHAIRMAN NORTON:  Okay.  So -- and  
9   frankly, most all of us, but one, have read that  
10  document, and you do raise dispute or raise  
11  contradiction to some of or all of the findings that  
12  we produced, both in the formula -- the formulaic  
13  annual evaluations that we produced, the two, and the  
14  -- I think 27 point addendum that was attached.  And  
15  so, at this point in time I take it that you believe  
16  that that writing suffices or entails everything you  
17  want to say in response to the November 9th  
18  evaluation?

19                   MR. INGRAM:  That is not what I said,  
20  and that is not my belief.

21                   CHAIRMAN NORTON:  Other than asking  
22  questions of each individual Commissioner, which I  
23  don't want to proceed with, you have no other  
24  elaboration you would like to proceed with?

18

1                   MR. INGRAM:  Mr. Chairman, I don't  
2   think that I can proceed without questioning the

3 Commissioners as to what they voted on, their reasons  
4 for ruling in a particular manner on the evaluation.

5 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay.

6 MR. INGRAM: What I seek to do is get  
7 clarification to satisfy myself that the evaluation  
8 was done in a thorough and complete and truthful  
9 manner.

10 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. And let me  
11 tell you that --

12 MR. INGRAM: And this --

13 CHAIRMAN NORTON: -- you needn't  
14 satisfy yourself because the Commission is satisfied  
15 that it was done in a complete and truthful manner.

16 And so, while you may have qualms about  
17 that, you needn't.

18 MR. INGRAM: Then I apologize for being  
19 a citizen of the United States of America.

20 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Thank you very much.  
21 Commissioner Griffin.

22 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: I would just  
23 like to further point out that, you know, that this is  
24 not a hearing, as I stated in an earlier memo that I

19  
1 sent everybody. It's not a hearing. It's not a  
2 trial. And we don't really have to entertain what  
3 we're entertaining at this point. I think we're doing  
4 a service and offering you a courtesy at this point.  
5 And, you know, I just think that, you know, let's cut  
6 through the chase. If you don't really have anything

7 to say, then . . .

8 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Mr. Ingram, if you  
9 have organized yourself such that your response to  
10 (B)(1) was going to be a series of questions to the  
11 Commissioners, which I don't think -- I don't think  
12 would ever be regarded as the appropriate way to  
13 proceed, then maybe you would want a couple of minutes  
14 to recollect your thoughts to respond in any other  
15 fashion. I don't want you to stumble upon a previous  
16 plan that isn't being allowed if you had other things  
17 that you want to say.

18 So, if you would like to reorganize  
19 your statements in a different fashion, please feel  
20 free to.

21 MR. INGRAM: Mr. Chairman, I understand  
22 the difference between a hearing, the difference  
23 between a trial, and the difference between a special  
24 meeting, as opposed to a regular meeting. I

20  
1 understand all of those things.

2 I also understand that I am not going  
3 to be permitted to get to the bottom of the issues  
4 that concern me, from your earlier ruling and comments  
5 from other Commissioners. So, it's all the same to me  
6 that I stand on what I submitted earlier.

7 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay. Thank you very  
8 much.

9 Item (B)(2) is performance of the

10 Executive Director.

11                   You have asked for a postponement of  
12 Items (B)(2), and I guess also (B)(3). We're now at  
13 that stage. Is that still your request?

14                   MR. INGRAM: That's still my request.

15                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: And -- Commissioner  
16 Griffin.

17                   COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: I would just  
18 like to say that I'm opposed to any alteration in this  
19 agenda whatsoever, and that we go through with (2),  
20 (3) and (4) as noted on the agenda.

21                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: I have to apologize.  
22 Mr. Teed had my ear for a second and I didn't hear  
23 everything you've said. I apologize, Commissioner  
24 Griffin. Would you mind repeating yourself?

21

1                   COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: I said that we  
2 are opposed to any revision of the agenda, at least I  
3 am opposed.

4                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay.

5                   COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: And that I would  
6 recommend that we go forward with the agenda as is.

7                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: As I think all of the  
8 Commissioners are aware, we have already been posed  
9 this question about postponing what I would consider,  
10 you know, one of the meaty parts of this meeting. One  
11 of the reasons to call this meeting. And it was the  
12 decision of the Chair, and I responded to Mr. Ingram,  
13 and cc'ed the members -- although, I don't know if you

14 were en route and near your e-mail, this morning that  
15 we would not postpone any part of the meeting. And  
16 that's still my decision.

17 I think that this meeting has been  
18 legally noticed. I think that the agenda items are  
19 timely. And I think that the eight present members of  
20 this Commission are prepared to make decisions and  
21 make actions in a perfectly deliberate and informed  
22 fashion without a delay.

23 And again, I'll point out, as the  
24 Assistant Attorney General pointed out, that the law

22

1 requires no notice for any action we may take, but we,  
2 as a Commission, did give notice both in the form of  
3 allowing over a week and a half period of written  
4 response, and then earlier this week a chance for an  
5 oral response. And I have doubly invited today  
6 Mr. Ingram to orally respond. He has a method he  
7 wants to pursue that isn't appropriate, and so he  
8 doesn't seem to be orally responding at this point.

9 But as to the performance of the  
10 Executive Director do you have any comments that you  
11 want to make on (B)(2)? We will not be postponing.

12 MR. INGRAM: As I stated earlier, I  
13 need to avail myself of counsel on these matters that  
14 I was not informed that would be part of this agenda  
15 until I received a letter on Tuesday morning at 11:00  
16 a.m. I am not prepared. My counsel could not be here

17 because of a previous engagement, and therefore I am  
18 not prepared to respond to that item.

19                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: And I would like to  
20 say point understood that the issues before us are not  
21 legal issues. This Commission has the power express  
22 to take disciplinary action against the Executive  
23 Director at any time, and, as you heard, including  
24 dismissal. So, a lawyer's perspective isn't what's

23

1 needed right now, because we aren't debating legal  
2 issues. We aren't debating Loudermill. We aren't  
3 debating due process or due property, or property  
4 interest. We are debating the intelligence of making  
5 a decision based on policy instincts and facts that  
6 we've observed. So, a lawyer's perspective isn't in  
7 this part of the process.

8                   MR. INGRAM: So, are you saying,  
9 Mr. Chairman, that proper procedures has no place in  
10 this meeting?

11                   CHAIRMAN NORTON: I'm saying that  
12 proper procedures have every place in this meeting,  
13 and we are following them. And as I pointed out, we  
14 in fact are, and have been affording you notice and  
15 the right to respond in excess -- well in excess of  
16 the laws requirements.

17                   And I am, based on the advice of people  
18 in three different agencies of state government,  
19 absolutely convinced of the correctness of that  
20 statement.

21 I have been advised that the Loudermill  
22 decision in particular and other cases out there that  
23 may apply do not prohibit us from proceeding as we  
24 might proceed this afternoon. I've been advised that

24  
1 by people at the Commission on Human Rights and  
2 Opportunities, at the Office of the Attorney General,  
3 and at the Department of Administrative Services.  
4 People experienced at the highest levels of all those  
5 agencies.

6 So, we now move to Item -- if there are  
7 any other comments of Commissioners -- Commissioner  
8 Lobon.

9 COMMISSIONER LOBON: I just want to  
10 speak on the record, I was not involved in the  
11 development or structure of this particular  
12 evaluation, and have not been involved in any meetings  
13 to structure and develop this particular evaluation  
14 process. So, I just want to make sure that you do not  
15 indicate that all Commissioners.

16 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay.

17 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Just be careful of  
18 indicating that.

19 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Sure. For the  
20 record, the meeting at which the Commission finally  
21 adopted the annual evaluation of the Executive  
22 Director had eight members in attendance. Everyone  
23 here, including George Marshall. But, in fact,

24 Commissioner Lobon was not at that meeting, and so he

25

1 was not -- oh, I'm sorry, where it was written and  
2 worked on and developed in draft form.

3 Of course, at the meeting where it was  
4 adopted on November 9th Commissioner Lobon was present  
5 and voted no.

6 COMMISSIONER LOBON: That's right.

7 CHAIRMAN NORTON: But to make it  
8 clear --

9 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Mr. Chair, I just  
10 want to make known -- I understood what Mr. Lobon was  
11 saying. I also want to make note that that was his  
12 choice not to participate. And that's a different  
13 attitude than I was just absent. You chose not to be  
14 part of it. And so he had a right to make that  
15 choice.

16 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Yeah. But I don't  
17 want it to be called an attitude.

18 COMMISSIONER BROWN: I beg your pardon?

19 COMMISSIONER LOBON: With an attitude.  
20 That was my attitude not to attend. Okay.

21 COMMISSIONER BROWN: No. You made a  
22 choice not to be part of it.

23 COMMISSIONER LOBON: I know I made a  
24 choice. Right. I did make a choice.

26

1 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Uh-huh.

2 COMMISSIONER LOBON: But I want it to

3 be clear that I was not a part of the process.

4 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Yeah. But that's  
5 right.

6 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Okay.

7 COMMISSIONER LOBON: I just want it  
8 clear.

9 COMMISSIONER BROWN: It's not a  
10 debatable --

11 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Well, you're  
12 making it debatable. But I'm just saying, I'm saying  
13 I was not a part of the process.

14 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Okay.

15 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Okay. Thank you.

16 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Your point is well  
17 taken.

18 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Thank you.

19 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Okay.

20 CHAIRMAN NORTON: And correct that --

21 COMMISSIONER LOBON: There's no more  
22 discussion with it.

23 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Right.

24 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Thank you.

27

1 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Well, I'm just going  
2 to say one more thing, Commissioner, and that is to  
3 make it clear that at the final meeting where a final  
4 draft was worked on Commissioner Lobon was absent and  
5 was not part of the -- any authorship that was

6 occurring at that meeting.

7 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Right.

8 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Now, we're going to  
9 move on to Item (B)(3). The Chair would entertain a  
10 motion to dismiss the Executive Director, R. Hamisi  
11 Ingram, from the Executive Directorship of the  
12 Commission on Human Rights and Opportunities effective  
13 immediately.

14 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: So move.

15 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Commissioner Griffin  
16 has so moved. Is there a second.

17 COMMISSIONER CLARKE: Second.

18 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Commissioner Clarke  
19 has seconded it.

20 And excuse me just for a second.

21 (Pause.)

22 Some hieroglyphics were coming my way.

23 Are there any comments from any

24 Commissioners? The motion is to dismiss Mr. Ingram

28

1 from the Executive Directorship of CHRO effective  
2 immediately.

3 If there aren't, I did want to read  
4 something, which shouldn't take that long.

5 First and foremost, I want to thank my  
6 fellow Commissioners and commend you all for your  
7 devotion to the important work of this Commission.  
8 Few people know the many hours you have put in. You  
9 aren't paid at all, and you are thanked very little,

10 and let me pay you my thanks now.

11                   Another thing I would like to make as a  
12 point. It has been suggested that I might be  
13 interested in the job of Executive Director of CHRO.  
14 Let me say now, and with force, that this is not a  
15 desire of mine. Not remotely. Nor have I ever said  
16 to anyone that it is my desire. I would like to quote  
17 General William Sherman, "If nominated I will not run,  
18 if elected I will not serve, the job is not something  
19 I seek."

20                   And I'm just going to read for a couple  
21 of minutes here, and I apologize sometimes that's  
22 unseemly, but I'm going to do it.

23                   Our recent evaluation of the Executive  
24 Director points to many problems the Commission has

29

1 observed over the course of the year between August  
2 2005 and August 2006. Further, we have noted  
3 additional problems that have occurred since. We have  
4 given the Executive Director ample opportunity to  
5 respond to these strong concerns both in writing, and  
6 today in person. I do not believe that his responses  
7 effectively refute our criticisms at all.

8                   I want to say that when I became  
9 Chairman in June of this year I had a hope that the  
10 CHRO could change course for the better, for the sake  
11 of the agency, a group of roughly 100 professionals  
12 dedicated to doing a good and important job, and for

13 the sake of its mission, the protection and  
14 advancement of any Connecticut citizen or visitor who  
15 belongs to a group that has historically suffered  
16 discrimination in any form. That hope, my hope,  
17 rested on two premises, both of which were faulty.

18                 The first premise was a sense that  
19 while some poor decisions had been made, they were not  
20 that poor, and therefore the Executive Director could,  
21 with only a small change in outlook and management  
22 style change course.

23                 The second premise was the belief that  
24 the Executive Director would, in recognition of

30

1 mistakes that had been made, change his way of making  
2 decisions and change his judgments in what was best  
3 for the agency. Both premises, as I've said, turned  
4 out to be wrong.

5                 Upon further investigation and deeper  
6 study of the decisions that the Executive Director had  
7 made in the previous year I realized that many  
8 decisions were worse than I had imagined and that  
9 those poor decisions were more numerous than I had  
10 imagined. Many of his actions were far more  
11 ill-judged and ill-considered than I had known.

12                 Further, as the months went by I also  
13 realized that the Executive Director was not willing  
14 to see or could not see the problems he had created or  
15 exacerbated. Time and again he refused to adjust his  
16 perspective, his priorities and his assessments.

17 Simply put, my view that the problems were not that  
18 bad was wrong, and my hope that the Executive Director  
19 would change course was never realized.

20                   There have been numerous occasions,  
21 many reversals and many people to make him aware that  
22 the agency and its employees and its mission were  
23 suffering from his mistakes. He would not listen and  
24 he would not hear. Advice, warnings, even strong

31

1 direction from the Commission itself were to no avail.

2                   The Executive Director was not only  
3 uncomfortable with taking directions from the  
4 Commission, he was at times defiant. That has not  
5 worked, and it cannot work.

6                   In closing let me say that not too very  
7 long ago my fellow Commissioners and I did have  
8 worries about the Executive Director, but we also had  
9 good will. We had concerns, but we had hope. We had  
10 misgivings, but we had faith that it could all be made  
11 better. That goodwill and that hope and that faith  
12 have been disappointed. We are in charge of this  
13 agency, but we are also servants to its mission.

14                   And that's all I wanted to say at this  
15 point.

16                   Is there any other discussion from any  
17 Commissioners? (No response.)

18                   Then I will call for a vote. All those  
19 in favor of the immediate dismissal of Mr. Ingram as

20 Executive Director of CHRO please say aye.

21 COMMISSIONERS MENGUAL, GRIFFIN,

22 CONAWAY, CLARKE, MAMBRUNO, BROWN: Aye.

23 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Are there any

24 opposed.

32

1 COMMISSIONER LOBON: Opposed.

2 CHAIRMAN NORTON: Are there any

3 abstentions? (No response.)

4 So, the record will note that the

5 Commissioners Mambruno, Clarke, Brown, Mengual,

6 Conaway and Griffin voted aye, and Commissioner Lobon

7 voted no. The motion passes.

8 And there are no other personnel

9 matters presently before us, so Item (2)(D) does not

10 need to be addressed. We can skip over that.

11 I invite people, again, to consider --

12 although I don't think people are inclined to, whether

13 the second Thursday at 2:00 is, of every month, the

14 best time. We'll adopt that schedule next year --

15 next meeting, on December 14th.

16 But if anyone sort of thinks, oh,

17 there's better times, this is the time to do it for

18 the next year. Or at least think about it for the

19 next meeting.

20 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: I just want to

21 point out something. I think Ray Pech, or somebody,

22 sent an e-mail -- was it you, Ray, that sent an e-mail

23 out the other day with a correction on a date --

24 COMMISSIONER BROWN: Oh, for January.

33

1 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: For January. I  
2 think you made an error on that date. I'm not  
3 certain, but you said the 14th.

4 MR. PECH: The 14th.

5 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: You mentioned  
6 the 14th as being the date that we would meet in  
7 January. That's an impossibility because the 14th is  
8 on a Sunday.

9 MR. PECH: I think it's the 11th as I  
10 sit here, but if the letter misstated that --

11 COMMISSIONER BROWN: It said the 14th.  
12 So you meant the second Thursday.

13 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Okay.

14 MR. PECH: I still have 30 days to  
15 notify the Secretary of State.

16 COMMISSIONER GRIFFIN: Okay.

17 MR. PECH: But thank you for the  
18 clarification.

19 CHAIRMAN NORTON: So, to be clear, if  
20 you don't hear otherwise we'll be meeting on January  
21 11th. Our next meeting is December 14th at 2:00 at  
22 CHRO.

23 Is there a motion to adjourn?

24 COMMISSIONER BROWN: So moved.

34

1 CHAIRMAN NORTON: All those in favor.



6 I, Nancy E. Paretti, a Notary Public in  
7 and for the State of Connecticut, do hereby certify  
8 that the foregoing record is a correct and verbatim  
9 computer-aided transcription of the proceeding  
10 hereinbefore set forth.

11 I further certify that I am neither  
12 counsel for, nor related to, nor employed by any of  
13 the parties to the action in which this proceeding is  
14 taken and further certify that I am not related to,  
15 nor an employee of any attorney or representative  
16 employed by the parties thereto, nor am I financially  
17 interested in this action.

18 In witness whereof I have hereunto set  
19 my hand and affixed my notarial seal this date,  
20 December 3, 2006.

21 \_\_\_\_\_  
22 Nancy E. Paretti  
23 Notary Public

24 My commission expires February 28, 2007.